

Dr. Alejandro Esguerra and Prof. Dr. Holger Straßheim Workshop funded by the Fritz Thyssen Foundation Standing Groups Sociology of IR and Standing Group Politics, Science and Technology, both German Political Science Association

Online Workshop, May 27th & 28th 2021

# OBJECTS OF EXPERTISE THE POLITICS OF SOCIO-MATERIAL EXPERT KNOWLEDGE IN WORLD SOCIETY

If anything, the Corona pandemic teaches us the profound influence of expertise on our daily life. We are willing to decrease social contacts to a minimum and risk our economic well-being because a distinct group of experts provides us with their, partly competing expert knowledge.

Objects of various sorts – models, curves, masks – play a decisive role here. They serve "as centering and integrating devices" (Knorr Cetina, 1997, p. 9) for research, governance, and public debates; they make tangible what otherwise remains, for many of us, intangible; and yet, they are contested and continually acquire new properties.

While Covid-19 is surely an extreme case, objects of expertise have become central in policy fields as diverse as public health, the environment and security politics. They are currently being studied in multiple disciplines such as International Relations (IR), Public Policy, and Science and Technology Studies.

This workshop aims at exploring several questions, among them, what are the functions and roles of objects of expertise in world politics? Who designs these objects and what are the politics of their creation? What do objects of expertise unveil and what do they black-box? How do objects contribute to create as well as to disturb existing order? How and why do political actors delegate decisions to objects of expertise?

### **Practicalities**

- The workshop is held on Zoom. You will receive a separate invitation per email.
- We have no formal discussant to save time and to create a lively discussion. We encourage everyone to take notice of the circulated papers and provide feedback, especially to those that are work in progress.
- Individual papers will be presented for ten minutes, after which there is 20 minutes time for Q&A and comments. We allocated more time for the opening and closing talks to cover some cross-cutting themes.
- As chair you are free to either go for a minimal role and look after the time, or you can structure the discussion and point to emerging themes.
- During the meetings: Please turn your camera on and mute your microphone. If you want to ask a question or make a contribution, please enter an "X" in the chat box or enter the question directly. Please feel free to use the chat box for other communications with the participants.
- This is the workshop #: #objexbielefeld

## Thursday 27<sup>th</sup> May 2021

00.00			
09:00am – 09:15am	WELCOME AND INTRODUCTION		
	Opening-Up Objects of Expertise Alejandro Esguerra and Holger Straßheim, <i>Bielefeld</i>		
09:15am – 10:45am	OBJECTS OF EXPERTISE, OBJECTS OF IGNORANCE CHAIR: DELF ROTHE, IFSH HAMBURG		
	Between Expertise and Ignorance: State Monitoring of Unauthorized Residents Christina Boswell, Edinburgh		
	Unknown and unseen: the 'not-yet-ness' of knowledge and the making of governance objects Katharina Glaab, Oslo		
10:45am – 11:15am	Break		
11:15am – 12:15am	ENGINEERING AS WORLD POLITICS CHAIR: THOMAS MÜLLER, BIELEFELD	WHEN OBJECTS OF EXPERTISE TURN DIGITAL CHAIR: AUDREY ALEJANDRO, LSE	
	Making the global climate malleable: the implications of geoengineering for the structure of the international system Olaf Corry, Leeds	Planet Politics 4.0: EU Copernicus and the imaginary of a 'Digital Twin Earth' Delf Rothe, IFSH Hamburg	
	Making instruments of intervention - the international politics of climate engineering expertise  Ann-Kathrin Benner, IFSH Hamburg	Producing Truths in the Global Factory: Digital Supply Chain Management Tools as Objects of Human Rights Expertise Christian Scheper, Duisburg	
12:15am – 01:15pm	Break		
01:15pm – 02:15pm	Ambivalences of Object Performativity Cair: Stefan Aykut, Hamburg	SEMANTIC OBJECTS OF POLICY ADVICE CHAIR: LAURA PANTZERHIELM, DRESDEN	
	Numbers as Artefacts. The Performativity of Quantification Katja Freistein, GCR Duisburg	The ambivalent promise of narrative: reflections on a new governing tool in policy advice and communication  Frank Gadinger, GCR Duisburg and Sebastian	
		Jarzebski, Neues Handeln	
	Keeping military expenditure data ambivalent: how states influence the form of number games in world politics Thomas Müller, <i>Bielefeld</i>	Boundary objects of expertise: Evidence instruments and their constituencies Arno Simons, <i>DZHW Berlin</i>	
02:15pm – 02:45pm	Break		
02:45pm – 04:00pm	HISTORIES OF EXPERTISE CHAIR: KATHARINA GLAAB, OSLO		
	On magic bullets and the rise of modern international expertise: Policy designs against cholera at the International Sanitary Conference of 1892 Luis Aue, WZB Berlin  Designating the climate: The geopolitics of climate science, 1945-1961 Bentley Allan, Johns Hopkins		
09:00pm – 09:30pm	Online get together: Bielefeld in a box		

	Friday 28 <sup>th</sup> May 2021	
09:00am – 09:15am	IDENTIFYING CROSS-CUTTING THEMES ALEJANDRO ESGUERRA AND HOLGER STRAßHEIM, BIELEFELD	
09:15 – 10:45am	INFRASTRUCTURING WORLD POLITICS CHAIR: OLAF CORRY, LEEDS	
	Oceans, Objects and Infrastructures Christian Bueger, Copenhagen	
	<b>Training certificates Infrastructuring ICT Expertise</b> Anna Leander, <i>Geneva</i>	
10:45am – 11:15am	Break	
11:15am – 12:45pm	REPRESENTING OBJECTS IN DISCOURSE CHAIR: KATJA FREISTEIN, GCR DUISBURG	WHEN OBJECTS MAKE FUTURES CHAIR: Christian Scheper, Duisburg
	How International Organizations turned a genital Ritual into a Global Health Policy: The resemantisation of male circumcision as a practice of world politics  Audrey Alejandro and Joshua Feldman, LSE	Predictive policy assemblages Stefan Aykut, <i>Hamburg</i>
	A risky object? How microplastics are represented in German media Ruth Müller and Sarah Schönbauer, Munich	IPCC as "Map-Maker" Silke Beck <i>, UFZ Leipzig</i>
	Knowing and Governing through Human Rights: The UN 'Human Rights Based Approach to Programming' an as Object of Expertise Laura Pantzerhielm, <i>Dresden</i>	Carbon Budgeting: Assembling the Future and Assigning Responsibility in a Warming World Eva Lövbrand, Linköping and Johannes Stripple, Lund   cancelled
12:45pm – 01:45pm	Break	
01:45pm – 02:45pm	REFLECTION: OBJECTS, EXPERTISE AND WORLD SOCIETY CHAIR: MATHIAS ALBERT, BIELEFELD	
	Expert knowledge in World Society - an institution Ole Jacob Sending, <i>Oslo</i>	nal view
	Publication Strategy	

All Participants

### **Toward a Conceptualization of Objects of Expertise**

This workshop gives center stage to objects of expertise and the ways in which they are involved in the politics of world society. Expertise is usually defined as specialized knowledge that has gained authority by both professionals and political actors (Strassheim, 2015). Epistemic communities hold such "recognized expertise" within a particular domain (Haas, 1992, p. 16). International organizations, for instance, the World Health Organization (WHO) ground their authority on specialized knowledge (Barnett and Finnemore, 2004). Extending these conventional theories of expertise, objects of expertise, in a first approximation, can be defined as an array of socio-material entities that constitute specialized knowledge, and that is used and (collaboratively) worked on to convince both professionals and political actors of claims to expertise.

Two developments in current theorizing motivate this workshop. First, recent advances in International Relations (IR) have conceptualized problem construction as a process of constituting objects (Allan, 2018; Corry, 2013; Lövbrand and Stripple, 2011; Sending, 2015). Collectively, this body of work suggests viewing problems of world politics such as the corona pandemic, or the depletion of the ozone layer not as given but as something that is rendered known and governable through distinct practices. For climate change, Lövbrand and Stripple (2011, p. 188) draw attention to the "seemingly humble and mundane mechanisms (e.g. techniques of notation, accounting, auditing) that have turned carbon" into a coherent object of governance. Foregrounding objects poses the question by which means objects emerge, how they gain attention, and how they attract efforts of governing. In other words, conventional approaches examine how, for instance, an epistemic community knows of an object and how its members channel this knowledge into policy processes. In contrast, studying world politics as an assembly of objects means investigating how expert knowledge takes part in constituting objects such as the "ozone" including the practices, institutions, technologies, etc. From an object centered perspective, the question is "how those elements are combined into stable configurations that constitute the landscape of problems and issues" (Allan, 2018, p. 16).

While some objects of expertise are relatively stable, others are in a state of indeterminacy (Knorr Cetina, 1997); they are objects-in-formation (Laube et al., 2020). Enigmatic and elusive on first encounter, they develop their status gradually over time, by prompting decisions and demanding positionings. The current corona pandemic can serve again as useful reference. On 11 February 2020, the WHO announced a name for the new coronavirus disease: COVID-19. Since then, virologists but also social psychologists and legal experts continue to characterize COVID 19 and its effects. An object of expertise is in the making.

The second development concerns the interest in the socio-material dimension of expertise and its artifacts. Early work in STS has laid out in detail how scientific knowledge production depends on and is intertwined with the material environment of the laboratory including instruments, inscription devices, model organisms etc. (Knorr-Cetina, 1981; Latour and Woolgar, 1979). Recent scholarship has mobilized these insights to study governing practices (Aykut, forthcoming; Bueger, 2015; Voß and Freeman, 2016). Among other things, artifacts of knowledge such as indicators, models, or surveys have been analyzed to study the political work of these objects of expertise (Boswell, 2018; Freistein, 2016). An intriguing example relates to the rise of scenarios. The IPCC, in particular, has developed a new generation of emissions scenarios that involve highly problematic speculative technologies, a fact that often goes unnoticed (Beck and Mahony, 2018). Thus, such objects are part and parcel not only of describing a reality but bringing possible futures about (Aykut et al., 2019; Esguerra, 2019). Others have highlighted how digital supply chain management tools – from sustainability management software to so-called 'worker voice tools' – begin to monitor ecological and social impacts of business operations (Scheper, 2015, forthcoming). These tools or devices transform how governing is realized. In security politics, advertising tracking devices are a means to deepen the grip of military security matters (Leander, 2019). Security expertise can be contained in, reproduced by, and disseminated through a material object such SanctionsApp (Biersteker, 2018), or satellites (Rothe, 2017). Perhaps, what unites this scholarship is an interest in the ways in which objects of expertise co-produce political order. While objects might appear as apolitical tools, they are performative as they suggest and form specific policies.

#### References

Allan, B.B., 2018. From subjects to objects: Knowledge in International Relations theory. European Journal of International Relations 24. https://doi.org/10.1177/1354066117741529

Aykut, S.C., forthcoming. Reassembling energy policy. Models, scenarios and policy change in Germany and France. Science & Technology Studies.

Aykut, S.C., Demortain, D., Benbouzid, B., 2019. The Politics of Anticipatory Expertise: Plurality and Contestation of Futures Knowledge in Governance â Introduction to the Special Issue. Science & Technology Studies 32, 2–12.

Barnett, M., Finnemore, M., 2004. Rules for the world: International organizations in global politics. Cornell University Press.

Beck, S., Mahony, M., 2018. The politics of anticipation: the IPCC and the negative emissions technologies experience. Global Sustainability 1, 1–8.

Biersteker, T.J., 2018. SanctionsApp as expertise (and exclusionary ignorance) in a global policy setting, in: Leander, A., Weaver, O. (Eds.), Assembling Exclusive Expertise. Knowledge, Ignorance and Conflict Resolution in the Global South. Routledge, London, pp. 153–169.

Boswell, C., 2018. Manufacturing political trust. Cambridge University Press.

Bueger, C., 2015. Making Things Known: Epistemic Practices, the United Nations, and the Translation of Piracy. International Political Sociology 9, 1–18.

Corry, O., 2013. Constructing a Global Polity. Palgrave MacMillan, New York.

Esguerra, A., 2019. Future objects: tracing the socio-material politics of anticipation. Sustainability Science 14, 963–971. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11625-019-00670-3

Freistein, K., 2016. Effects of indicator use: a comparison of poverty measuring instruments at the World Bank. Journal of Comparative Policy Analysis: Research and Practice 18, 366–381.

Haas, P.M., 1992. Introduction: Epistemic Communities and International Policy Coordination. International Organization 46, 1–35.

Knorr Cetina, K.K., 1997. Sociality with objects: Social relations in postsocial knowledge societies. Theory, culture & society 14, 1–30.

Knorr-Cetina, K., 1981. The manufacture of knowledge. Pergamon Press, Oxford.

Latour, Bruno., Woolgar, S., 1979. Laboratory life: the social construction of scientific facts. Sage, London.

Laube, S., Schank, J., Scheffer, T., 2020. Constitutive Invisibility. Exploring the Invisible Work of Staff Advisers in Political Position Making. Social Studies of Science.

Leander, A., 2019. Sticky security: the collages of tracking device advertising. European Journal of International Security 4, 322–344.

Lövbrand, E., Stripple, J., 2011. Making climate change governable: accounting for carbon as sinks, credits and personal budgets. Critical Policy Studies 5, 187–200.

Rothe, D., 2017. Seeing like a satellite: Remote sensing and the ontological politics of environmental security. Security Dialogue 48, 334–353.

Scheper, C., 2015. 'From naming and shaming to knowing and showing': human rights and the power of corporate practice. The International Journal of Human Rights 19, 737–756.

Scheper, C., forthcoming. Producing Truths in the Global Factory: Digital Supply Chain Management Tools as Objects of Human Rights Expertise. Presented at the Offene IB Sektionstagung, 7. bis 9. Oktober 2020, Freiburg, Establishing Human Rights through Objects of Expertise.

Sending, O.J., 2015. The Politics of Expertise: Competing for Authority in Global Governance. University of Michigan Press.

Strassheim, H., 2015. Politics and policy expertise: towards a political epistemology, in: Fischer, F., Torgerson, D., Orsini, M., Durnova, A. (Eds.), Handbook of Critical Policy Studies. Edward Elgar Publishing.

Voß, J.-P., Freeman, R., 2016. Knowing Governance: The Epistemic Construction of Political Order. Palgrave Macmillan.